

2QR'S Transatlantic Claim Disproved

IT will be recollected by our readers that a year ago this fall wide publicity was given the account that the 100 watt (input) telephone set of Messrs. Hugh and Harold Robinson, at Keyport, N. J., had been heard in Scotland. Although the results of our Transatlantic Tests show that it is not altogether beyond belief that such powers can be heard on the other side, QST has never felt that the evidence submitted in the case of 2QR could be interpreted as definite proof of its accomplishment, and, it will be remembered, is the only one of the national radio magazines which refrained from an unquestioned acceptance of the report. Accordingly we have watched with interest the efforts of a committee of the Radio Club of America which for the past year has gradually been collecting data on this subject and whose work has just been completed. The matter is of all the more interest to us coming just at this time, as it clears the way for our own A.R.R.L. Transatlantic Records and gives conclusive proof that we are the first to cross the ocean on schedule.

The report of the R.C.A. Committee, announcing their findings, reads as follows:

December 7, 1921.

TO THE PRESIDENT OF THE RADIO CLUB OF AMERICA:—

On November 1st, 1920, there appeared in various issues of New York press, statements that radio station 2QR located at Keyport, N. J., and owned and operated by Mr. Hugh Robinson, had succeeded in transmitting speech and phonograph music to Aberdeen, Scotland. These articles were based on a letter received by Mr. Robinson from an amateur operator, Mr. George Benzie, of Aberdeen. In this letter, Mr. Benzie stated that he had succeeded in receiving two phonograph musical selections and the signature of station 2QR on October 6, 1920, at about 6 P.M. Greenwich Mean Time.

Following the appearance of these articles in the press, a Committee was appointed by the president to investigate the authenticity of the alleged transmission. During the course of this investigation, other letters were received by Mr. Robinson and by the Committee from Mr. Benzie and a collaborator, a Mr. James Miller, also of Aberdeen, claiming the reception of signals from station 2QR on subsequent occasions.

After an investigation lasting over a year and rendered difficult on account of the distances involved, the Committee obtained evidence which settles the point in issue. We have laid this evidence before Mr. Robinson with the result that he is now convinced that Messrs. Benzie and Miller are in error concerning their belief that

they had received the signals of station 2QR. His letter to the Committee stating this fact is attached hereto.

Let us here state that we do not question but that the original letter of Mr. Benzie was given to the press by Mr. Robinson in good faith. We have no doubt on this point whatever. But we are unable to state on what basis the letters of Messrs. Benzie and Miller were written and in view of the fact that at the time they allege reception of the signals of 2QR, this station was not transmitting, we do not believe that their letters merit further serious comment.

We find that station 2QR was not heard in Scotland as reported.

Committee on Transatlantic
Communication,
Radio Club of America.

(Signed:)

E. H. Armstrong, Chairman,
A. A. Hebert,
L. G. Pacent.

We enclose herewith 42 exhibits with a detailed consideration of the evidence.

The following is the text of the Robinson statement referred to in the Committee's report:

13 Walnut St.,
Keyport, N. J.
Dec. 5, 1921.

Committee of Investigation,
Radio Club of America.

After seeing the evidence which has been secured by the Committee of Investigation of the Radio Club of America regarding the alleged reception of our Radio Phone signals by Messrs. Benzie and Miller, of Aberdeen, Scotland, we are convinced that according to this evidence Messrs. Miller and Benzie were in error in believing that they heard our signals.

We are glad to make this statement to the Committee after going over the matter in detail with them in order to clear up and settle the matter conclusively.

(Signed:)

Hugh Robinson,
Harold H. Robinson.

It is needless for us to go into the matter to any great length as we believe the two letters will explain themselves and give A.R.R.L. members a very good idea of the situation. We are grateful to the Radio Club of America for cleaning up this matter in the interests of the game and we also know that the Messrs. Robinson are glad in the interests of accuracy to have the matter settled, and are to be complimented for the broad-minded position they have taken.